



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru **The National Assembly for Wales**

Y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes **The Enterprise and Business Committee**

Dydd Iau, 02 Hydref 2014
Thursday, 02 October 2014

Cynnwys **Contents**

Craffu ar Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen yr Iaith Gymraeg a Datblygu Economaidd
Scrutiny of the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal,
cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol **Committee members in attendance**

Rhun ap Iorwerth	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Jeff Cuthbert	Llafur Labour
Byron Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives

Keith Davies	Llafur Labour
William Graham	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Welsh Conservatives (Committee Chair)
Eluned Parrott	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Gwenda Thomas	Llafur Labour
Joyce Watson	Llafur Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Dr Martin Rhisiart	Aelod o'r Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar y Gymraeg a Datblygu Economaidd a Chyfarwyddwr, Cyfadran Busnes a Chymdeithas, Prifysgol De Cymru Member of the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group and Faculty of Business and Society, University of South Wales
Elin Rhys	Cadeirydd y Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar y Gymraeg a Datblygu Economaidd a Rheolwr Gyfarwyddwr Telesgop Chair of the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group and Managing Director of Telesgop

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Rhys Iorwerth	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Siân Phipps	Clerc Clerk
Richard Watkins	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 13:41.
The meeting began at 13:41.

Craffu ar Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen yr Iaith Gymraeg a Datblygu Economaidd
Scrutiny of the Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group

[1] **William Graham:** [*Inaudible.*]—our usual explanation that the meeting is bilingual and headphones can be used for simultaneous translation from Welsh to English on channel 1, or for amplification on channel 0. The meeting is being broadcast and a transcript of proceedings will be published. May I remind Members and witnesses that there is no need to touch the microphones? They should come on automatically. In the event of a fire alarm, would people please follow directions from the ushers?

[2] This afternoon, could I, first of all, welcome Jeff Cuthbert and Gwenda Thomas to our committee? They are both distinguished servants of Wales and of the National Assembly. We are very grateful for your attendance today; thank you for coming and joining our committee. I have apologies from Dafydd Elis-Thomas and from Mick Antoniw, and no substitutions.

[3] So, could we please now go into questions? The first question this afternoon is from Rhun.

[4] **Rhun ap Iorwerth:** Diolch yn fawr iawn. Prynhawn da iawn i chi. A gaf i ddechrau, cyn mynd i mewn i fanylion am feysydd penodol o fewn y gwaith y buoch chi'n edrych arno, efo'ch argraffiadau cyffredinol o sefyllfa'r berthynas rhwng yr economi a'r iaith Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd a lle mae rhyngweithio rhwng y ddau?

Rhun ap Iorwerth: Thank you very much. Good afternoon. May I start, before we go into detail about specific areas within the work that you have been carrying out, with your general impressions of the situation at the moment in terms of the relationship between the economy and the Welsh language and where there is interaction between them?

[5] **Ms Rhys:** Beth yw hyd y cyfarfod?

Ms Rhys: How long is this meeting?

[6] **Rhun ap Iorwerth:** O, mae gennym ni ryw awr. [*Chwerthin.*]

Rhun ap Iorwerth: Well, we have about an hour. [*Laughter.*]

[7] **Ms Rhys:** Diolch yn fawr. A gaf i yn gyntaf gyflwyno fy hun? Elin Rhys ydw i, a fi yw cadeirydd y grŵp, a dyma Martin Rhisiart a oedd yn aelod ffyddlon o'r grŵp. Mae'n gwestiwn sydd bron a bod yn amhosibl i'w ateb, oherwydd rwy'n credu bod angen i ni wneud llawer mwy o waith i ddod i'r afael â hynny. Un o'r anawsterau, er ei bod hi wedi bod yn fraint ac anrhydedd i gadeirio'r grŵp ac i edrych ar y materion yn ymwneud â'r iaith a'r economi, oedd bod ehangder yn y maes. Yn bersonol, ymgymerais â'r gwaith am fy mod i'n teimlo'n angerddol bod eisiau i ni ddod i ddeall yn well y ffordd y gall yr iaith hybu'r economi. Fodd bynnag, roedd dau faes i'w hystyried yn y fan hon, sef sut gall yr iaith hybu'r economi a sut gall yr economi hybu'r iaith. I raddau, roedd y ffaith ei fod mor eang a bod y ddau faes yn mynd â ni i gyfeiriadau gwahanol yn golygu ei bod hi'n anodd iawn i ganolbwyntio ar y naill na'r llall, a oedd yn rhwystredigaeth bersonol i mi, oherwydd fy mhrif ddiddordeb i oedd gallu profi a dangos bod yr iaith Gymraeg yn gallu helpu'r economi, am fy mod i'n bersonol wedi blino braidd ar glywed pobl yn dweud ei bod hi'n fwrn ar yr economi i gefnogi'r iaith. Roeddwn i eisiau dangos bod yna ffyrdd y gall yr iaith Gymraeg hybu'r economi. Felly, i ateb eich cwestiwn chi, a oedd braidd yn gyffredinol i mi allu ei ateb, nid wyf i'n gwybod beth yw'r ateb.

Ms Rhys: Thank you very much. May I, first of all, introduce myself? I am Elin Rhys, and I am the chair of this task and finish group, and this is Martin Rhisiart, who was a faithful member of the group. It is a question that is almost impossible to answer, because I think that we need to do far more work in order to get to grips with that. One of the difficulties, although it has been a pleasure and a privilege to chair the group and to consider issues related to the Welsh language and the economy, was that there was a whole range of issues to consider in this area. Personally, I undertook the task because I feel passionately that we need to better understand how the Welsh language can promote the economy. However, there were two areas for consideration here, namely how the Welsh language can promote the economy and vice versa. To a certain extent, the fact that it was such a broad field and the two areas were taking us in different directions meant that it was very difficult to focus on one or the other, which was a personal frustration for me, because my main interest was to prove and demonstrate that the Welsh language can assist the economy, because I personally have grown tired of hearing people say that supporting the Welsh language is a burden on the economy. I wanted to show that there are ways in which the Welsh language can promote the economy. Therefore, to respond to your question, which was a little general for me to be able to answer, I do not know how to answer it.

[8] **Rhun ap Iorwerth:** Martin, yn gyffredinol, a yw'r iaith Gymraeg a busnes wedi cael eu cadw ar wahân yn ormodol?

Rhun ap Iorwerth: Martin, generally, have the Welsh language and business been kept separate too much?

[9] **Dr Rhisiart:** Rwy'n meddwl, i raddau, fod y carfannau wedi bod ar wahân ac y bu diffyg yn y gorffennol ar ran y rhai sydd eisiau hybu'r iaith Gymraeg i fynd i'r afael â maes busnes, a bron eu bod yn gweld bod busnes yn broblem.

Dr Rhisiart: To a certain extent, I think that there has been some separation and that there was a problem in the past in terms of those who want to promote the Welsh language grappling with the world of business, and almost seeing business as a problem.

13:45

[10] Rwy'n meddwl bod y sefyllfa wedi newid, ond un o'r pethau eraill o ran pwynt cychwynnol i mi oedd edrych ar, yn hanesyddol, sut oedd Cymru wedi datblygu yn economaidd, a sut oedd hynny wedi cael effaith ar yr iaith. I raddau helaeth, rwy'n gweld sefyllfa Cymru yn wahanol i un gwledydd eraill lle mae ieithoedd lleiafrifol, yn yr ystyr, os ydych yn edrych ar fap o lle mae siaradwyr Cymraeg yng Nghymru—a lle mae canrannau uchel o siaradwyr Cymraeg—wrth gwrs, maent yn tueddu i fod yn y gorllewin. Yn y gorllewin, yn ddaeryddol ac yn economaidd, nid oes cymaint o ddwystrer ac amrywiaeth economaidd, o ran gweithgaredd. Felly, yn hanesyddol, maent yn tueddu i fod yn ardaloedd lle mae mwy o amaeth, wrth gwrs—lle mae canran uchel o siaradwyr Cymraeg—ond hefyd nid ydynt yn perthyn gymaint i'r elfen graidd o ddatblygu economaidd, sydd yn fwy gweledol o fewn dinasoedd a threfi.

I think that the situation has changed, but one of the other starting points for me was to look, historically, at how Wales had developed economically, and how that had impacted the language. To a great extent, I see the position of Wales as being different from that of other nations where there are minority languages, in the sense that, if you look at a map of where Welsh speakers are in Wales—and where there are high percentages of Welsh speakers—they tend to be in the west. In the west, geographically and economically, there is not as much economic intensity and diversity, in terms of activity. So, historically, they tend to be areas where there is a greater dependency on agriculture, of course—where there is a high percentage of Welsh speakers—but also they are not as involved with that core element of economic development, which is more visible within the urban environment of our towns and cities.

[11] Felly, i mi—ac roedd hyn yn amlwg cyn i mi ddechrau ar y gwaith hwn—mae'n wendid hanesyddol yng Nghymru nad ydym, er enghraifft, â sefyllfa fel Catalonia lle mae Barcelona yn ddinas Gatalaneg. Rydym bron â bod wedi gweld yr iaith Gymraeg fel rhywbeth nad yw'n annatod i ddatblygu ein diwydiadannau, a'n trefi, a'n dinasoedd. Yn awr, rwy'n meddwl bod hynny yn newid, ond, i raddau, rwy'n gweld yr anghydbwysedd hwnnw yn bodoli yn ddaeryddol ac yn gymdeithasol, ynghyd ag yn economaidd.

So, to me—and this was evident before I even started this work—it is a historic weakness in Wales that we do not have, for example, a situation like that of Catalonia, where Barcelona is a Catalan city. We have almost seen the Welsh language as something that is not inherent to developing our industries, and our own towns and cities. Now, I do think that that perception is changing, but, to a certain extent, I do see that imbalance persisting socially and geographically, as well as economically.

[12] Rwy'n meddwl ein bod wedi cyffwrdd ar hynny mewn sawl ffordd yn ystod gwaith y grŵp, ond, i ddod nôl at y cwestiwn cyntaf, mae bwlch hanesyddol wedi bod rhwng y rhai sydd â'u prif ffocws ar

I think that we did touch upon that in a number of ways during the group's work, but, to return to the first question, there has been a historic gap between those who have their main focus on economic development,

ddatblygu economaidd, ac, ar y llaw arall, y bobl sydd wedi bod yn canolbwyntio fwyfwy ar yr iaith, ac ar hybu a diogelu'r iaith. Rwy'n deall pam bod y gwahaniaethau hynny wedi bod, ond nid yw'n ein helpu ni, rwy'n meddwl, i symud ymlaen.

[13] **Ms Rhys:** Os caf gyfeirio at fy niwydiant fy hun, sef diwydiant y cyfryngau, byddwn yn dweud bod hwnnw'n un o'r rhai prin yng Nghymru lle mae modd gweithredu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae ysgolion Cymraeg, yn naturiol, yn gweithredu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a rhai colegau, rhai adrannau o gynghorau sir, a rhai mentrau iaith, ond, o ran y sector preifat, y diwydiant cyfryngol yw un o'r rhai prin lle rydym wedi llwyddo i gynnal diwydiant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yng Nghymru, ac mae'n bwysig diogelu hynny.

[14] **Rhun ap Iorwerth:** Fe wnaeth y Gweinidog, wrth gwrs, wrth osod cylch gorchwyl ar eich cyfer, fynnu set o argymhellion a oedd yn gallu cael eu gweithredu. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed ar ôl i chi gyhoeddi eich argymhellion, roedd pobl yn dweud wrthy, 'Na, dydyn ni dal ddim yn gallu gweld sut all y Gymraeg hybu twf economaidd.' Beth oedd eich barn chi am y math hwnnw o negyddiaeth?

[15] **Ms Rhys:** A ydych chi'n meddwl y negyddiaeth oddi wrth y bobl a oedd yn ysgrifennu atom ni?

[16] **Rhun ap Iorwerth:** Y bobl a oedd, hyd yn oed o weld eich argymhellion chi—sydd i fod yn bethau sy'n gallu cael eu gweithredu—yn dal i fod yn amheus o'r syniad y gall y Gymraeg rywsut hybu twf economaidd.

[17] **Ms Rhys:** Nid ydym wedi cael unrhyw ymateb negyddol ers hynny, felly byddai diddordeb gyda fi i wybod gennych beth yw'r ymatebion. Nid ydym wedi cael unrhyw ymateb felly. Yr unig ymatebion yr ydym wedi eu cael yw'r rhai a oedd yn dilyn o'r holiaduron a wnaethom eu hanfon allan. Roedd rhai yn wrthun ac yn hollol negyddol, ac roedd rhai a oedd yn bositif tu hwnt, fel y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl pan ydych yn anfon y pethau hyn mas.

and, on the other hand, those who have concentrated more on the Welsh language, and on promoting and safeguarding the language. I understand why that has been the case, but I do not think that it helps us in moving forward to the future.

Ms Rhys: If I could refer to my own industry, namely the media, I would say that that is one of the more rare industries where you can operate through the medium of the Welsh language. Welsh-medium schools operate through the medium of Welsh, obviously, as well as some colleges, some departments of county councils, and some *mentrau iaith*, but, in the private sector, the media is one of those rare industries where we have succeeded in maintaining an industry through the medium of Welsh in Wales, and it is important to safeguard that.

Rhun ap Iorwerth: The Minister, of course, when she set a remit for you, insisted that you present a set of recommendations that could be implemented. However, even after you published your recommendations, people told you, 'No, we still cannot see how the Welsh language can promote economic growth.' What was your opinion about those kinds of negative attitudes?

Ms Rhys: Do you mean the negativity of those responding to us?

Rhun ap Iorwerth: The people who, even after seeing your recommendations—which are supposed to be things that can be implemented—were still suspicious of the idea that the Welsh language can somehow promote economic growth.

Ms Rhys: We have not had any negative response since then, so I would be interested in hearing which responses you are referring to. We have not received any such responses. The only responses that we have received were the ones following on from the questionnaires that we sent out. There were some that were entirely opposed and entirely negative, and others were extremely positive, as you would expect when you send out these things.

[18] Fodd bynnag, rwy'n credu bod rhwystredigaeth, onid oes, pan ydych chi mewn busnes yn y byd go iawn, mas yn y fan honno, os ydych yn gweld rhyw lefel arall o fiwrocratiaeth, rhyw fynnu i chi ddilyn rheolau, neu haen arall o waith i chi, os y mynnwch, sef yr angen i fod yn ddwyieithog? Rwy'n credu bod ofn a rhwystredigaeth oherwydd yr arian, oherwydd mae'n brysus mas yn y fan honno—mae unrhyw un sy'n rhedeg busnes yng Nghymru yn ei ffeindio hi'n anodd; nid yw'n hawdd.

[19] Yr hyn yr oeddwn i ei eisiau yn bersonol—a'r hyn rwy'n credu roedd y grŵp yn dymuno ei weld—oedd y gallem ni ffeindio ffordd bositif o ddangos i bobl bod yna ffyrdd y gallai'r iaith Gymraeg hybu'r economi. Yn yr argymhellion wnaethom ni eu llunio, rwy'n credu ein bod yn bod yn onest yn dweud bod angen mwy o waith. Roedd yn llawer yn rhy eang, o bosibl, i ni fod mor bendant ag y liciem fod wedi bod. Rwy'n cofio addo i mi fy hun ar y dechrau: 'Reit, rwy'n mynd i wneud yn siŵr, os ydw i'n cymryd hwn ymlaen fel cadeirydd y grŵp hwn—y tro cyntaf imi wneud unrhyw beth fel hyn ac, mae'n siŵr, y tro olaf—', addewais i fi fy hun na fyddai'r un argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad yn dweud bod eisiau mwy o ymchwil. Ond, mae arnaf ofn, unwaith yr euthum i'r afael ag ef i gyd, daeth yn hollol glir bod angen mwy o ymchwil, achos mae posibiladau lle gall yr iaith helpu'r economi, ac mae eisiau mwy o waith i fod yn fwy penodol er mwyn gallu hybu'r rheini.

[20] **Gwenda Thomas:** Cawsoch dystiolaeth oddi wrth y sector gofal preswyl a gofal cartref yn y sector preifat. O'm profiad i, mae brwdfrydedd mawr i hybu'r Gymraeg yn y diwydiant hwn. Tybed a ydych wedi cael unrhyw dystiolaeth ar ba mor effeithiol y mae 'Mwy na geiriau' wedi bod, ac a yw hynny'n creu pwysigrwydd a bod yn ffocws, fel mae 'Mwy na geiriau' yn ceisio ei wneud?

[21] **Ms Rhys:** Nid wy'n meddwl ein bod ni wedi, na?

[22] **Dr Rhisiart:** Hyd y cofiaf, ni chawsom unrhyw ymatebion gan gartrefi preswyl yn y sector gofal, yn rhai preifat

However, I think that there is frustration, is there not, when you are in business in the real world out there, if you see another level of bureaucracy, some insistence that you have to follow rules, or another layer of work, if you like, namely the need to work bilingually? I think that there is fear and frustration because of the money involved, because it is busy out there—anyone who runs a business in Wales finds it difficult; it is not easy.

What I personally wanted—and I think what the group wanted to see—was that we could find a positive way of showing people that there are ways and means whereby the Welsh language can promote the economy. In the recommendations that we drew up, I think that we were honest in saying that more work needs to be done. It was far too broad, possibly, for us to be as definitive as we would like to have been. I remember promising myself at the outset: 'Right, I am going to make sure that, if I take this on as chair of this group—it is the first time I have ever done something like this, and it will probably be the last—', I promised myself that there would not be a single recommendation in the report saying that we needed more research. But, I am sorry to say that, once I got to grips with the whole issue, it became entirely apparent that more research was needed, because there are possibilities where the Welsh language can help the economy, and more work needs to be done so that we can be more specific in promoting those areas.

Gwenda Thomas: You received evidence from the residential care sector and residential home care in the private sector. In my experience, there is great enthusiasm for promoting the Welsh language in that area. I wonder whether you had any evidence of how effective 'More than just words' has been in embedding importance and being a focus, as 'More than just words' tried to do.

Ms Rhys: I do not think that we did, did we?

Dr Rhisiart: As far as I can recall, I do not think that we received any responses from residential homes in the care sector, whether

neu'n rhai cyhoeddus, na chan gyrff sy'n siarad ar eu rhan. Rwy'n gwybod ei bod yn faes pwysig iawn a bod angen diwallu anghenion pobl sy'n derbyn gwasanaethau gofal i sicrhau eu bod yn cael gwasanaethau dwyieithog, a gwasanaeth Cymraeg lle maent yn mynnu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Yn fwy bras ac yn ehangach, gwnaethom ein gorau i annog pobl i roi tystiolaeth ger ein bron, ond roedd yn dalcen caled.

in the private sector or the public sector, or from bodies speaking on their behalf. I do know that it is an exceptionally important area and that there is a need to meet the needs of those receiving care services to ensure that bilingual services are available, and a Welsh-language service where they demand that. More generally speaking, we did our best to encourage people to provide evidence to us, but it was a difficult task.

[23] **Ms Rhys:** Rwy'n cytuno, a byddwn yn cytuno â chi ynglŷn â'r sylw. Mae fy mam ar hyn o bryd mewn cartref preswyl, ac mae wedi dod yn fwyfwy amlwg i mi bwysigrwydd dybryd cael y gwasanaeth Cymraeg hwnnw, a brwdfrydedd y staff er mwyn ei sicrhau. Ac ategu'r pwynt a wnaeth Martin, rhoesom wahoddiad am dystiolaeth—wel, aeth e mas drwy beth bynnag yw'r gwasanaeth y mae'r rheini'n cael eu hanfon trwyddo—a buom yn hynod siomedig â'r ymateb. Yn naturiol, roedd y cyrff y byddech yn eu disgwyl—cyrff sy'n llobio o ran yr iaith, a chyrff nad ydynt yn leicio'r iaith—yn dymuno ymateb. Yn y diwedd, oherwydd ein rhwystredigaeth gyda chyn lleied o bobl yn ymateb, gwnaeth pob un ohonom ar y grŵp, yn bersonol, ysgrifennu at ryw 30 o bobl yr un yn gofyn am ymateb ganddynt yn bersonol, ac roedd yr ymateb i hynny hyd yn oed yn llugoer, gwaetha'r modd. Mae arnaf ofn bod bai arnaf, ond ni wneuthum gysylltu â'r mudiadau preswyl, a dylaswn fod wedi gwneud.

Ms Rhys: I agree, and I would agree with you about that comment. My mother is in a residential home at the moment, and the importance of having a Welsh-language service has become increasingly clear to me, as has the enthusiasm of the staff to ensure that. To reiterate what Martin said, we did invite evidence—well, it went out via whatever the service is that sends those things out—and we were extremely disappointed with the response that we got. Naturally, those bodies that you would expect to respond—those that lobby on behalf of the language, and those that are perhaps less keen on the language—wanted to respond. In the end, because of our frustration at having so few respondents, every one of us on the group wrote personally to some 30 individuals each, asking for a response, and even the response we got to that was lukewarm, unfortunately. I am afraid that I am perhaps to blame for this, but I did not contact the residential homes sector when perhaps I should have done.

[24] **Gwenda Thomas:** Diolch.

Gwenda Thomas: Thank you.

[25] **Jeff Cuthbert:** On the issue of coverage, you referred to journalism as one where there was particular keenness. I am relatively new to the committee, so I have not been engaged in any of the previous work. If I heard you correctly, you said that the response from other occupational areas was poor. So, in terms of the rest of the Welsh economy, such as the construction sector, which is very important, within registered social landlords—and there is a section in your report that deals with that—did you have any feedback from them about how they felt about the role of the Welsh language as a skill in itself? Were they engaged, or not?

[26] **Ms Rhys:** Not.

[27] **Dr Rhisiart:** No.

[28] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Okay, that was a simple answer. Thank you.

[29] **Keith Davies:** O edrych ar yr adroddiad yr ydym ni wedi ei gael yma, mae **Keith Davies:** Looking at the report that we have had here, people have complained, and

pobl wedi cwyno, ond nid ydych wedi trafod hynny. Gwedsoch yn gynharach nad oeddech chi wedi eu gweld, ond yn ôl y manylion sydd o fy mlaen i, mae rhagair yr adroddiad yn gweud eu bod wedi cael eu cyhoeddi ar wefan Llywodraeth Cymru.

[30] **Ms Rhys:** Sori, nid wyf yn deall eich cwestiwn chi.

[31] **Keith Davies:** Mae'r bobl a oedd yn cwyno—y rhai nad ydynt yn cefnogi'r Gymraeg—yn gweud y byddai'n broblem fawr iddynt a'u busnes, ac yn y blaen. A oeddech wedi gweld y rheini?

[32] **Ms Rhys:** Do, do. Maen nhw yn yr adroddiad, ac maen nhw wedi cael eu cyhoeddi gyda'r adroddiad—ar beth bynnag yr ydych yn cyhoeddi eich adroddiadau. Mae mas o'n rheolaeth ni. Rydym ni jyst wedi gwneud yr adroddiad ac wedi tynnu sylw at y llythyron hynny, ac wedi eu trafod nhw yn ddi-ben-draw yn ein cyfarfodydd. Maen nhw ar gael i unrhyw un eu gweld, hyd y gwn i.

[33] **Keith Davies:** Felly, beth oedd y gŵyn fwyaf oedd gyda nhw?

[34] **Dr Rhisiart:** Ar y cyfan, nid pobl a oedd yn rhedeg busnesau oedden nhw. Nid wy'n meddwl bod yr un ohonynt yn rhedeg busnes. Rwy'n meddwl mai pobl a oedd, ar y cyfan, yn elyniaethus tuag at y Gymraeg oedden nhw, pa ffordd bynnag y byddai'n dod i'r amlwg yn y cyd-destun hwn yn edrych ar y berthynas rhwng yr economi, busnes a'r Gymraeg. Felly, efallai mai'r bobl hynny sy'n ysgrifennu'n aml at bapurau newydd lleol oedden nhw. Hynny yw, nid pobl â phrofiad busnes mohonynt.

[35] **Ms Rhys:** Rwy'n credu bod yna un ymateb—os cofiaf yn iawn, gan ei bod hi'n 10 mis ers inni gyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn bellach, ac mae llawer o ddŵr wedi mynd o dan y bont—gan fudiad a oedd yn cynrychioli sector y cyfrifwyr, o bosibl. Roedd yn eithaf cryf ei farn na ddylid gwario unrhyw geiniog i gefnogi cyfrifwyr a oedd yn dymuno gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Wrth gwrs, rwy'n adnabod sawl un sy'n dymuno gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, felly mae'n anodd gwybod o ble'r oedd yr ymateb hwn wedi dod. Serch hynny, roeddem

you have not discussed that. You said earlier that you had not seen that, but according to the details that I have here, the foreword to the report says that they were published on the Welsh Government's website.

Ms Rhys: Sorry, I do not understand your question.

Keith Davies: The people who complained—those who did not support the Welsh language—said that it would be a problem to them and their business, and so on. Did you see those responses?

Ms Rhys: Yes, yes. They are contained within the report, and they are published alongside the report—wherever you publish your reports. It is out of our hands now. We simply drew up the report and highlighted those letters, and we discussed them ad infinitum at our meetings. They are available to anyone to see, as far as I am aware.

Keith Davies: So, what was the biggest complaint they had?

Dr Rhisiart: For the most part, they were not people who were running businesses. In fact, I do not think that any of them was running a business. They were mostly people who were anti-Welsh language, whichever way that would emerge in looking at the economy, business and the Welsh language. So, perhaps they were some of these people who often write to local newspapers. However, they were not people with business experience.

Ms Rhys: I think that there was one response—if my memory serves me correctly, as it is now 10 months since we published this report, and there has been a lot of water under the bridge since then—from an organisation representing the accountancy sector, maybe. It was quite strongly of the opinion that not a single penny should be spent on supporting accountants who wanted to work through the medium of Welsh. Of course, I know several who wish to work through the medium of Welsh so it is difficult to know where those responses came from.

yn siomedig, yn naturiol.

However, we were disappointed, naturally.

[36] **Keith Davies:** Mewn un ffordd, nid oeddent yn ymwneud â'r economi o gwbl, a jest yn erbyn yr iaith oedden nhw.

Keith Davies: In a way, they were not involved in the economy at all, and they were just anti-Welsh language.

[37] **Ms Rhys:** Ie. Dyna beth rydym yn ei deimlo ym mêr ein hesgyrn.

Ms Rhys: Yes. That was the feeling that we had in our water, at least.

[38] **Dr Rhisiart:** Roedd ymatebion o gyrff sy'n siarad am fusnes, megis y CBI a Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach.

Dr Rhisiart: There were responses from bodies such as the Confederation of British Industry and the Federation of Small Businesses, which speak on behalf of business.

[39] **Ms Rhys:** Ni ddaeth dim byd oddi wrth y CBI.

Ms Rhys: We did not get anything from the CBI.

[40] **Dr Rhisiart:** O ran Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach, cawsom gyflwyniad a chlywsom fod awydd gan fusnesau bach i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg o ran deunyddiau marchnata, arwyddion ac yn y blaen, a gwneud yn siŵr bod cyfieithiadau ar gael o'u gwefannau. Felly, mae yna chwant o ran busnesau bach i ddefnyddio mwy, ond bod modd eu cefnogi. Felly, dyna un o'r argymhellion: sicrhau bod yna gymorth ymarferol ar gael i helpu busnesau bach sy'n gwneud cant a mil o bethau ar yr un pryd.

Dr Rhisiart: In terms of the FSB, we got a presentation and we heard that small businesses were keen to use the Welsh language in their marketing materials, on signage and so on, and to ensure that translations were available of their websites. So, small businesses are keen to use more Welsh, as long as they can be supported. So, that is one of the recommendations: to ensure that there is some practical help for small businesses, which do a thousand and one things all at the same time.

[41] **Keith Davies:** Ysgrifennodd un cyn-aelod o'ch grŵp erthygl ar gyfer adran fusnes y *Western Mail* rai misoedd yn ôl yn sôn am hynny, gan wneud cymhariaeth â'r Iwerddon ac yn y blaen.

Keith Davies: A former member of your group wrote an article for the business section of the *Western Mail* some months ago, discussing that very issue, making comparisons with Ireland and so on.

[42] **Ms Rhys:** Rwy'n credu ei bod yn bwynt ofnadwy o bwysig. O ran cwmnïau bach, mae'r gair 'bach' weithiau yn ddilornus, oherwydd maent yn gwmnïau pwysig iawn i economi Cymru, rwy'n credu, yn enwedig yn y sector bwyd a'r sector twristiaeth, lle gall yr iaith ddenu mwy o gwsmeriaid. Rwy'n credu bod y bobl y siaradais i â nhw—y bobl a roddodd dystiolaeth yn y sectorau hynny—wir yn frwdfrydig i arbrofi i gael gweld pa wahaniaeth y gallai wneud. Mae'n risg, onid yw, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yn enwedig pan fydd y pwysau ychwanegol biwrocrataidd hwn arnoch i gymryd y risg hwnnw?

Ms Rhys: I think that it is an exceptionally important point. In relation to small companies, the word 'small' can sometimes be insulting because they are companies that are really important to the Welsh economy, I think, particularly in the food and tourism sectors, where the language can attract more customers. I think that the people whom I spoke to—the people who gave evidence from those sectors—were truly enthusiastic to experiment and see what difference it could make. However, it is a risk, is it not, as I said earlier, particularly when there is this additional bureaucratic pressure on you to take that risk?

[43] O ran gwledydd eraill, rwy'n

In terms of other countries, I often refer to a

cyfeirio'n aml at rywle o'r enw Sancerre. Efallai eich bod i gyd yn yfed Sancerre yn yr ystafell hon, nid wyf yn gwybod. Mae pentref Sancerre wedi adeiladu diwydiant ardderchog o gwmpas yr enw hwnnw, sydd ddim jyst yn ymwneud â gwin. Mae pawb yn ei gysylltu â'r gwin Ffrengig da, ac mae'r dref ei hun wedi manteisio'n aruthrol drwy hynny. Nid wyf yn gweld pam na allwn ni wneud hynny yng Nghymru. Mae eisiau gwella'r ddelwedd.

place call Sancerre. Perhaps you all drink Sancerre in this room, I do not know. The village of Sancerre has built a whole industry around that name, and it is not just about the wine. Everyone links it with the quality French wine, and the town itself has taken huge advantage of that. I cannot see why we cannot do the same thing here in Wales. We just need to improve the image.

[44] Rwy'n eich cofio chi'n sôn am y teledu. Euthum i'r BBC yn Llundain unwaith i wneud *pitch* o syniad am hanes Cymru. Roedd *A History of Scotland* newydd fod ar y rhwydwaith, a meddyliais i, 'Wel, yffach, mae eisiau mynd a chael rhaglen deledu ar *'the history of Wales'*. Eisteddais gerbron y comisiynydd yn Llundain, a dywedodd,

I recall you mentioning television. I went to the BBC in London once to pitch an idea about Welsh history. *A History of Scotland* had just been on the network, and I thought, 'Well, gosh, we need to go and get a television programme on the history of Wales, too'. I appeared before the commissioner in London, and he said,

[45] 'What has Wales got, then, Elin? When you look at Scotland, they have got whisky and kilts. What has Wales got?'

[46] Cwypais i mas gydag ef wedyn, yn naturiol, a chawsom sgwrs eithaf—. Roedd yn rhywbeth na ddylech ei wneud gyda'ch comisiynydd rhaglenni. Ar y ffordd adref ar y trê, dechreuais feddwl, 'Oce, wel, beth yw'r pethau hyn sydd gyda ni y gallwn ni eu marchnata i hybu'r economi?' Dyna pam mae fy niddordeb i yn y grŵp hwn, a pham mae gennyf y rhwystredigaeth, efallai, fod angen inni ganolbwyntio'n fwy ar y pethau hynny y gellid eu gwneud i wella'r economi. Rwy'n credu ei bod yn bosibl.

I fell out with him after that, naturally, and we had something of an argument, which is something you should not do with your programming commissioner. However, on the way home on the train I started to think, 'Okay, well, what are these things that we have that we can market to promote the economy?' That is why I was so interested in the work of this group, and that is why I am so frustrated, perhaps, that we need to concentrate more on those things that can be done to improve the economy. I think that it is possible.

14:00

[47] **William Graham:** Jeff is next on this point.

[48] **Jeff Cuthbert:** I just want to be clear about what you said earlier about the FSB and the CBI. Did you engage with them or not?

[49] **Dr Rhisiart:** Yes.

[50] **Ms Rhys:** Yes.

[51] **Jeff Cuthbert:** You did.

[52] **Dr Rhisiart:** They did provide written evidence.

[53] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Right, okay.

- [54] **Dr Rhisiart:** They did not come and present to us—
- [55] **Ms Rhys:** They did not come and present to us, no.
- [56] **Dr Rhisiart:** But they did provide written evidence.
- [57] **Jeff Cuthbert:** All right, thank you.
- [58] **Ms Rhys:** It would have been nice.
- [59] **William Graham:** I would like to move on a little bit, if I may. Could I ask you about the Minister's response and the 'Moving Forward' policy document? What are your views on the submissions to the consultation that were sceptical, and how have the recommendations been taken into account by the Minister? Would you say that that was worthwhile?
- [60] **Ms Rhys:** Actually, I thought that we were here to discuss the report. I do not know whether I want to discuss the Minister's response to that.
- [61] **William Graham:** That is fine. I just wondered whether you had any response to that.
- [62] **Ms Rhys:** No.
- [63] **William Graham:** Fair enough. Eluned, you are next.
- [64] **Eluned Parrott:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. **Eluned Parrott:** Thank you, Chair. I want to Rwyf eisiau gofyn am farchnata'r iaith, ond ask about marketing the language, but in yn Saesneg, yn anffodus. English, unfortunately.
- [65] Obviously, having a unique language is a massive cultural asset for a country and it has huge marketing potential. We see the potential for culture and we use that potential very well, I think, in terms of tourism, though not necessarily in terms of the language as part of that culture. I wonder whether you can tell us what opportunities you feel there are to be using that kind of cultural identifier, if you like, that differentiation strategy, to market other kinds of products from Wales, particularly perhaps food and drink produce, which is a very strong niche market for us, and somewhere where perhaps that might be helpful?
- [66] **Ms Rhys:** I just want to refer you back to my Sancerre answer. I really do think that we are missing a trick and that the language can certainly be used to make us look unique in that marketplace. Food and drink in Wales are absolutely amazing, and I think that there is a real hunger out there, if you pardon the pun, to see it on a far more global scale. I do believe that connecting it with the Welsh language—. Sorry, should I be doing this in Welsh? I have forgotten.
- [67] **Eluned Parrott:** It is entirely up to you.
- [68] **Ms Rhys:** If we add the Welsh language to our marketing, I do believe that that would give us a distinct advantage in the marketplace. People like distinctiveness, and that is what gives us distinctiveness. It is not just the taste, but the feel of the bottle. When you go into a delicatessen, if a product has foreign words on it, it almost makes it better, and I reckon that, if those words were in Welsh, that would help. Certainly, in tourism, I think that we are missing a trick, and I think that the report kind of goes a little way towards saying that.
- [69] **Dr Rhisiart:** I think, to some extent, it is horses for courses. For example, I have

done some research on high-tech engineering and manufacturing, and there is no obvious value for the Welsh language in terms of promoting those sectors because they are completely different. However, for the ones that you refer to, particularly for tourism and for food and drink, creating a high-value brand, which is associated with quality, with experience and with positive values, does help in differentiating and in creating a brand. I know that there have been attempts to create a stronger sense of a Welsh food and drink brand and a sense of place. There are definitely—and we have referred to a couple of examples, I think—companies that do that that also have a high-quality product, which sells well and which sells elsewhere in the UK and overseas.

[70] **Eluned Parrott:** One example might be Halen Môn, which is very successful. Clearly, the Welsh Government has quite recently been working on its brand strategy, and on how a kind of place brand for Wales might transfer to other parts of the market offer that Wales is offering, other than tourism. Is that a step in the right direction, and do you think that there are other underpinning things that the Welsh Government could be providing to encourage and assist other smaller businesses to be using this as an asset for them?

[71] **Ms Rhys:** Yes, I think so. I am trying to think of an example that we discussed in the group that would be appropriate for you here. For instance, you go to breakfast in a hotel in Aberystwyth, which actually makes a huge effort to be Welsh. There are a couple of them: there is Gwesty Cymru, the Richmond Hotel, and a lot of them. One of them in particular has butter that is Welsh butter, but the label is entirely in English. I think to myself, 'They are missing a trick here'. If that label was in Welsh, it would promote the language, but also you could create business for people who wish to make a living out of and employ people to supply Welsh-language labelling, to provide a service for anybody who wants to market their stuff. That, in itself, in some ways, is helping the economy, because you are creating new work for people, in the same way that translation is an industry because of our need to be bilingual. Therefore, that is a business that is creating jobs. I do not know if that is a good enough example, but there are things like that.

[72] There are also things like call centres. I cannot remember who we spoke to about call centres, but they were thinking 'Oh gosh, we are going to have to have call centres in all of these places in England and there are going to have to be Welsh speakers there'. I just wondered why the call centre could not be in Wales. There are things like that—and perhaps we could have joined-up thinking—that the Senedd or the Government could promote.

[73] To come back to the issue of people not wanting to see the efforts they would have to go to being a burden, there should be some kind of support for them to take those initial risks, be that through a grant or some other form of incentive, because that would *talw ar ei ganfed*—it would pay dividends.

[74] **Eluned Parrott:** You talked about businesses too often viewing the language as a burden rather than an asset to them, and certainly things like creating a labelling industry creates value in the economy, but it also creates cost for the purchaser, so it is a double-edged sword in that instance. However, do you think that we need to be thinking about a change of mindset here in terms of moving away from a situation where we support the Welsh language through regulation and obligation as opposed to encouragement and support? Do we need to move along a different path now?

[75] **Ms Rhys:** Just to briefly answer your question about the butter thing, yes, there would be more cost for the hotel, but I think that ultimately it would see dividends because more people would come to the hotel. That is what we are trying to do, is it not: to use that language to increase the income of somebody, not to burden it?

[76] **Eluned Parrott:** Indeed, and if you get the brand proposition right, then obviously

something like that is adding value to the brand and adding value to the price that we can charge for the services that we are providing. However, as I said, I want to move on to the question of whether or not the culture of business is still that our approach has been punitive towards the Welsh language as opposed to positive and proactive and encouraging it to a sufficient extent.

[77] **Dr Rhisiart:** I think—and this is a generalisation—that businesses, on the whole, do not like regulation, of whatever form, whichever aspect of business it affects. So, for those who may not be convinced or who may not be bothered, it is quite easy, I suppose, to make that mental link between the Welsh language and, potentially, an extra cost. In terms of the work that we did, we viewed this as something that should be voluntary and, wherever possible, there should be help from Government where that was feasible, and also from other businesses in terms of networking and mentoring, doing it through example, and encouraging positive behaviours, rather than through regulation. Personally, I do not think that regulation would work for the vast majority of businesses. There may be a proportion of the business population of Wales for which it will work, because they are of sufficient scale, or they are suppliers of services or goods to the Welsh public service—in which case, there is expectation. We should expect them to be able to provide a service either to the public or to an intermediary if they are in receipt of significant public money. Otherwise, for the majority of businesses, it is something that we would want to see in the way of encouragement and practical support.

[78] **Ms Rhys:** It is an attempt to find ways in which the language can unite us and make us stronger, rather than divide us, which is a danger now.

[79] **Dr Rhisiart:** There is one recent anecdote that illustrates some of the issues that relate back to the butter example as well. I am the chairman of Cwllwm Busnes Caerdydd, which is the Welsh language business network, and we recently had our committee meeting, where we invited somebody to demonstrate a system that enables fees to be collected—membership, registration for events and so on—integrated in one system, which makes the administration of it far simpler. At the moment, the system is available only in English. It is a small company with only a few people. We asked whether this would be available in Welsh and, at the moment, it is not. We are just one small organisation and if there were 10, 15 or 20 of us, then that demand would probably justify the cost to them of providing the service in Welsh and maybe other languages as well. So, there is, I suppose, a point here over expressing demand in such a way that it becomes almost a default in service providers' minds that they can provide this, because providing it and re-engineering it after it happens is obviously more costly. So, that is a key issue in terms of expressing demand for services that would be more cost-effective then if you designed it into the service rather than having to re-engineer it later on.

[80] **Keith Davies:** Mae'r pwyllgor hwn hefyd wedi bod yn ymchwilio i dwristiaeth, ac roedd Eluned, y Cadeirydd a finnau yn Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Caerdydd rai misoedd yn ôl gyda phobl o fusnesau, gan gynnwys Penderyn—er nad ydyw wedi gwneud llawer ym mhentref Penderyn, o'r hyn rwy'n ei weld. Roeddent yn dweud bod y bobl sy'n dod i Gymru am fynd â rhywbeth gyda nhw o Gymru. Roeddech yn sôn am yr hyn maent yn ei wneud yn Iwerddon, sef cynnwys y ddwy iaith, ac mae'n bwysig bod busnesau yn gweld cyfle o ran hynny. Mae pobl wedyn yn dod yn ôl i'r busnes. Os ydynt

Keith Davies: This committee has also held an inquiry into tourism, and Eluned, the Chair and I were at National Museum Cardiff some months ago with people from businesses, including Penderyn—although it has not done much in the village of Penderyn, from what I can see. However, they said that, when people come to Wales, they want to take something home with them from Wales. You talked earlier about what is being done in Ireland, namely including both languages, and it is important that businesses see the opportunity in that regard. People then return to the business. If they want more and more

am i fwy a mwy o bobl ddod yn ôl, mae'n rhaid iddynt gynnig rhywbeth arbennig iddynt. Fel y dywedodd Eluned ar y dechrau, rydym yn lwcus bod yr iaith gennym, oherwydd mae hynny'n rhywbeth arbennig y gallwn ei gynnig yma nad ydynt yn gallu ei gynnig yn unrhyw le arall.

[81] **Ms Rhys:** Yn gymwys. Credaf eich bod yn llygad eich lle, ac rwy'n falch eich bod yn gwerthfawrogi hynny, achos dyna roeddwn yn trio ei ddweud.

[82] **Keith Davies:** Mae'n bwysig. Buom hefyd yn edrych ar faes teledu, ymhlith pethau eraill. Os ydych yn gallu gwerthu pethau yn Saesneg sydd hefyd ar gael yn Gymraeg, bydd mwy o bobl yn dod yn ôl i'r wlad hon i weld lle mae pethau'n cael eu ffilmio.

[83] **Ms Rhys:** Mae enghraifft perffaith o hynny yn y gyfres ddrama *Y Gwyll/Hinterland*, sydd wedi'i gwerthu i wledydd eraill. Mae pethau bach yn helpu weithiau. Rydym yn gwneud cyfres o raglenni gwyddoniaeth, ac rwyf wedi bod yn mynd i brifysgolion, fel Rhydychen a Chaergrawnt, gan siarad â gwyddonwyr o Gymru sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg, er nad oeddent yn gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn y prifysgolion hynny. Mae pobl eraill yn fy ngweld i yn eu cyfweld yn Gymraeg am eu pwnc ac maent yn synnu ac yn rhyfeddu, gan nad ydynt yn gwybod bod yr iaith Gymraeg yn cael ei siarad i'r graddau y mae hi; yn sicr nid oeddent yn meddwl bod pobl yn gallu trin a thrafod gwyddoniaeth yn Gymraeg. Roedd hynny'n sioc enfawr iddynt. Mae'n rhaid inni symud ymlaen o hynny. Mae eisiau inni wneud yn siŵr bod ein hiaith yn cael ei chydabod fel iaith nid yn unig ar gyfer unrhyw destun ond ar gyfer hybu'r economi a dod â gwerth yn ôl i Gymru.

[84] **Keith Davies:** Aethom hefyd fel grŵp i ymweld â Halen Môn ryw bythefnos yn ôl. Y ffaith yw ei fod wedi rhoi'r enw hwnnw iddo, a bydd mwy o bobl yn mynd i'r ynys i weld lle mae'n cael ei gynhyrchu ac yn y blaen, ac mae hynny o werth i'r busnes. Bydd y busnes yn adeiladu ar hynny.

[85] **Ms Rhys:** Os edrychwch ar yr adroddiad, gwelwch fod gennym

people to come back, they have to offer them something special. As Eluned said at the beginning, we are lucky that we have the language, because that is a unique thing that we can offer here that cannot be offered anywhere else.

Ms Rhys: Yes, you are exactly right, and I am pleased that you appreciate that point, because that is what I was trying to say.

Keith Davies: It is important. We also looked at the field of television, among other things. If you can sell something in English that is also available in Welsh, more people will come back to this country to see where things are filmed.

Ms Rhys: There is an excellent example of that in the drama series *Y Gwyll/Hinterland*, which has been sold to other countries. Small things can help on occasion. We produce a science series, and I have been going to universities, such as Oxford and Cambridge, speaking to scientists from Wales who are Welsh speakers, although they do not work through the medium of Welsh in those universities. Others see me interviewing them about their subject in Welsh and they are shocked and surprised to see that, because they did not know that the Welsh language was spoken to such an extent; they certainly did not think that people could discuss science in Welsh. That was something that was a huge shock to them. We have to move on from that position. We need to ensure that our language is recognised not only as a medium for discussing all subjects but also as a medium for boosting the economy and bringing value back to Wales.

Keith Davies: We also, as a group, visited Halen Môn about a fortnight ago. The fact is that the company has given the product that name and more people will go to the island to see where it is produced and so on, and that is valuable to the business. The business will build upon that.

Ms Rhys: If you look at the report, you will see that we have a recommendation regarding

argymhelliad ynglŷn â dyffryn Teifi. Rydym yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweld yn dda i wneud prosiect peilot yn yr ardal honno, oherwydd mae diwydiannau yno. Mae cynhyrchwyr caws a phob math o gwmnïau yn yr ardal honno ac mae'n bosibl iddynt wneud yr un peth â Halen Môn a'r llall y bu ichi sôn amdano, Penderyn.

the Teifi valley. We hope that the Minister will see fit to undertake a pilot project in that area, because there are industries there. There are cheese producers and all kinds of companies in that area that could do the same as Halen Môn and the other company that you talked about, Penderyn.

[86] **Keith Davies:** Bu ichi sôn am Sancerre a siaradais i am Benderyn.

Keith Davies: You talked about Sancerre and I talked about Penderyn.

[87] **Ms Rhys:** Dyna bach o gliw i chi am yr hyn yr wyf i'n ei yfed. Yn sicr, rwy'n gobeithio, os bydd y prosiect peilot yn digwydd, y byddwn yn gweld yr un math o ganlyniadau ag yr ydych wedi sôn amdanynt yn awr.

Ms Rhys: That gives you some sort of clue about what I drink. I certainly hope that, if that pilot project happens, we will see the same sort of outcomes as the ones that you have just described now.

14:15

[88] **Byron Davies:** At the risk of oversimplifying it, or being accused of doing that, is the answer not to expand the cottage industries? You gave the butter example and you mentioned the Teifi valley and a very good example there is Caws Cenarth. I can think of plenty of other examples.

[89] **Ms Rhys:** Yes, absolutely.

[90] **Byron Davies:** Is that not the way forward?

[91] **Ms Rhys:** I think that it is a way forward and—. Okay, whisky in Scotland is not a cottage industry, neither are the kilts, but there is an attempt, I suppose, to elevate cottage industries into something bigger and thereby strengthen the economy even more. If that answers your question, then I suppose, yes, it is. It is a means of enabling them to use the language to market their wares in order to become stronger and bigger. So, yes.

[92] **Dr Rhisiart:** On the same point, there are very different distribution channels in the UK compared with some other countries like France and Italy, for example, where they tend to be more regionally produced and consumed goods. So, that has an impact in terms of scale. I know from a conversation with one business owner whose company has been mentioned this afternoon that, in the early years of that company, they had to drive a van to different supermarkets in order to get that product onto the shelf, because the cost of trying to get into the normal distribution channel was prohibitive.

[93] The other thing that occurred to me from your point was: what is the added value? Ideally, it is something around processing rather than just the milk, as was the case when a lot of farms and companies were forced in the 1970s and 1980s to go into cheese production. I think that that is where a lot of the focus should be—around creating something that adds value through a process that is worth so much more to a customer. If you brand that, in bilingual terms—. In Welsh terms, it is worth a lot more than just the milk alone, for example.

[94] **William Graham:** Would you like to ask your question on networks, Byron?

[95] **Byron Davies:** Yes. Your report emphasised the importance of business networks for businesses operating bilingually and you said that you encourage the formation of clusters and

networks of businesses that use the Welsh language. The Government's response was that it was not the Welsh Government's responsibility to intervene in the formation of groups or networks. Presumably, you were disappointed at that. May I ask you to expand on the evidence base for encouraging this?

[96] **Dr Rhisiart:** I mentioned the example earlier on. In 1993, a Welsh-language business network was created, Cwlwm Busnes Caerdydd, and last year we celebrated 20 years. It does not rely on any public funding; it relies on a subscription from its members who also pay to come to dinners and other events. It seems to model—. Of course, there is a certain critical mass in Cardiff, which is not there in all parts of Wales, but I think that that is a model of a voluntary business network, which is run by its members for its members, that works quite well without any intervention from the public purse. There is certainly a business case for similar networks in other parts of Wales, and I am not sure why they do not exist. It may take the entrepreneurship of a few people, or a few groups of people, to get them up and running. Some pump-priming may help with some of them, but, again, I think that it is something that should be done on a voluntary basis.

[97] **Ms Rhys:** We are in Swansea and one of the benefits of clustering and networking in Swansea is that the Welsh people, the Welsh-speaking people and the Welsh businesses in Swansea, are far more dispersed than in Cardiff and a lot of them will be in the valleys. No disrespect to Cardiff, but it is sort of easier to get together in Cardiff for that than it is, maybe, in the Swansea valleys and that sometimes tends to hinder. In a capital city, you do have businesses that are located in the capital because of their very nature.

[98] Businesses in Swansea that operate through the medium of Welsh are not necessarily there for the same reason. I think it is harder to get those together. However, I do agree that this should be on a voluntary basis and, yes, there is probably blame on me in Swansea that I do not get together to form a cluster. However, again, out there in the real world it is difficult to get those things organised. Sometimes, being incentivised by the Welsh Government to do so would give people that impetus and that kick to do it and to do it properly. It is great just for finding staff, for example, when you are short of staff. The number of people who actually contact me saying that they need a receptionist who speaks Welsh and whether I could help—. It is those of the things—databases—to enable people who are really keen to do it. I will never forget that, once, a wonderful small company in Swansea was hiring out secretaries, and it proudly sent me an advert that it had made and that it had already sent out to businesses in Swansea. I opened up the envelope and there was little letter that said, 'Hi, Elin. We took your advice in our advertising and we now have a few Welsh-speaking secretaries', and when I read it, I saw that it had been Google translated and was dreadful. It was dreadful. I phoned up and said, 'Get them all back'. I explained to her why and she was mortified. So, she was of a mind to do it but did not have the right guidance to do it, which was a shame. If there had been some kind of network there, we could have stopped that faux pas from happening.

[99] So, obviously, I do not want to comment on what the Minister decided to do with that particular suggestion, but I think that it would have been good and helpful to the economy.

[100] **William Graham:** Could I just ask you again, for emphasis really: Welsh language as an additional skill? Do you see it in that way?

[101] **Ms Rhys:** As an additional skill—

[102] **William Graham:** In marketing terms.

[103] **Dr Rhisiart:** It certainly is if it is for communicating with service users whose preferred language is Welsh. I think it is interesting that there have been documented cases where companies have expressed disappointment, when they have provided Welsh-language

services, that the uptake of those services was low, and I think that we heard some of that evidence during our process.

[104] **Ms Rhys:** Yes, we did.

[105] **Dr Rhisiart:** So, I think there is a responsibility on the individual, and it is almost about that transitioning of the situation where the individual feels empowered to insist on the service being provided in Welsh, because, in many cases, Welsh speakers would be a little bit diffident, perhaps, and would not make a fuss. In other cases, of course, the larger companies do provide a Welsh-language service.

[106] **Ms Rhys:** It is a lot to do with confidence. Over my career, in the broadcasting industry, I have been extremely frustrated when Welsh speakers tell me, 'Oh, I don't want to be interviewed'. They say, '*Dyw fy Nghymraeg i ddim yn ddigon da*'—'My Welsh isn't good enough', and I think to myself, 'Flipping heck, it's better than mine'. It is almost as if people do not appreciate the skill that they have. So, it is really empowering, I think, when people suddenly realise that the language is not there for purists and it is not there purely for culture. It is a way of life for some people and to have that respected and considered a skill is empowering.

[107] **William Graham:** I agree with that. You were saying about the use of the Welsh language, particularly in—. You will know that, for some years now, rent demands have to be bilingual. Nobody likes to see the rent demand to begin with and I can remember complaints particularly on that. It seemed rather foolish to make the complaint, when everybody has to comply with the law.

[108] **Ms Rhys:** Sorry, what is the point that you are trying to make?

[109] **William Graham:** It is really that you should comply with the law, so why complain, because it is the law in Wales?

[110] **Ms Rhys:** Yes, indeed. But who is complaining?

[111] **William Graham:** Those receiving the demands, of course.

[112] **Dr Rhisiart:** They are probably the same people who wrote to us.

[113] **Ms Rhys:** Yes, those were the sorts of people.

[114] **William Graham:** Moving on, Joyce, would you like to come in on this point? Sorry, Joyce, Eluned wants to come in on this.

[115] **Eluned Parrott:** I just wanted to pin that down in terms of skill provision. You talk about confidence being really important and for both first-language Welsh speakers who, perhaps, move away from a first-language environment when they go to university, to new learners who are trying to gain experience in the language. So, what more could we be doing to help them use their language and gain that confidence? It is a real source of frustration that, while the number of Welsh speakers per se is, sadly, slowly falling, what seems to have fallen even faster, or what is much harder in terms of the business marketplace and the job market, is to hire people who have the confidence and the skills to be able, in particular, to write effectively in the Welsh language. What is missing from the training mix here?

[116] **Ms Rhys:** I think you have hit a nail on the head with that. I think that taking up some of these recommendations would help in that respect, because we thought long and hard about that side of things when we were preparing them. Also, it is kind of the other side of the

committee. We have talked a lot about how the Welsh language could help the economy, but this is more to do with how the economy could help the Welsh language in terms of training and gaining people's confidence. Giving people the opportunity and the feeling that they have a right to a job through the medium of Welsh is a great step forward. Young people knowing that there are jobs out there that they can go for with the additional skill of being bilingual, I think, is hugely important. If the standard of their Welsh is not what some people would term 'up to scratch', it is increased use and the opportunity that is going to—. Here is an interesting story. We do a radio programme on Radio Cymru in the afternoon with a presenter called Tommo, and when the programme first started, there was an outcry because Tommo's Welsh was not really terribly good, but what has happened is that he has opened the door to an awful lot of people who felt that maybe they were not part of the Welsh-speaking community. People who did not even listen to Radio Cymru because they thought that their Welsh was not good enough. They have now found that, yes, there is a place for them as Welsh speakers and that the more you use it, the better it gets. Even Tommo's Welsh has improved dramatically in the making of the programme. I think that those are the things that we need to do.

[117] For years, I presented a series called *Now You're Talking* to teach people to speak Welsh, and I still find, when I walk through Tesco or any other supermarket that I happen to be in, that people will come up to me and say, 'Oh, you used to teach me Welsh', and they will *dechrau siarad Cymraeg â fi*. There is a huge desire out there from people to speak Welsh. The more we can show them that there is an advantage, not just culturally and in their communities, but also that Welsh is a key to unlocking doors in the economy and jobs, then I think it is a win-win.

[118] **Dr Rhisiart:** I think it is particularly critical in that period between the ages of 16 and 25, when young people leave school. Let us take a fairly typical example: Welsh-language education has thrived and prospered in south Wales and south-east Wales over the last 20 years, where you have all these young people whose first language is not Welsh, because it is not the language of the home. They may have friends in the community who speak Welsh but it is not the main community language for them. They then go out into the wider world and, suddenly, they do not use Welsh and, before very long, they lose the confidence and they just do not have the practice. I think it is one of those critical things of having almost raised expectations, in terms of education, skills and employment pathways, that there are employment pathways available.

[119] There are a couple of examples that I have that are perhaps more positive, or which point to more positive ways of intervening. One, at the University of South Wales, in the last two to two and a half years, with the help of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, we have had Welsh-medium lectureships in business and management, and we are now taking some of those people who have left Welsh-medium schools, particularly in the south Wales Valleys, and they are starting to do some of their business management courses through the medium of Welsh. What we also did was provide a bridging course, because we pick them up in year 2, where they had gone through a whole year of probably not using Welsh very much to help them develop those skills again and become comfortable with studying in Welsh.

14:30

[120] If they had not done that, they would have maybe gone to the end of their university careers and probably when it came to graduation they would not even have thought of being in the position of applying for jobs where they needed to speak Welsh because of that lack of practice and a lack of confidence. The other thing, in terms of the demand side, is that there are many Welsh-language positions available, positions for which the Welsh language is essential. There are recruitment agencies that specialise in that and that are almost entirely dedicated to recruiting Welsh speakers, speakers of Welsh, for particular jobs. So, I think that there is a market pull there as well. For me, one of the key issues is how you then help those

people to transition, particularly from school into employment, where it becomes a virtuous circle and where they will continue to use Welsh and where they will demonstrate that to others.

[121] One of the other examples, referring back to Cwllwm Busnes Caerdydd, was that we invited some of those students into the meetings in order to meet other people from the business community and to demonstrate—to give them the confidence to speak to people, who are older, experienced professional people—that this is the pathway. There are these opportunities—you can speak to these people, and you may find out that there are some interesting jobs available.

[122] **Byron Davies:** I just have a brief point. Elin, I liked what you said about the people who can speak it, who really want to and who should be encouraged to speak it. I fall into that category as I was brought up speaking Welsh but I left off using it. There is a great deal of discussion out there about events such as the Eisteddfod and what have you. It is seen by some people as an elitist thing. How do you combat that, given what you said about encouraging people to have a go at it?

[123] **Ms Rhys:** I think that the first thing would be to go to the Eisteddfod because, if you go to the Eisteddfod you will realise that it is not elitist—

[124] **Byron Davies:** And not just the Eisteddfod—

[125] **Ms Rhys:** No, I know. It is difficult. Perception is such a tricky thing. I have never seen the Eisteddfod as elitist, but, then again, I see it with different eyes. However, I do take your point. I have many friends who do not want to go there because they feel that it is about purism and they feel on the edge. They do not feel part of it. I think that we have to address that for them. However, I think that the Eisteddfod goes to great lengths to try to change that, but changing perception is really, really difficult.

[126] **Byron Davies:** That is the challenge, is it not?

[127] **Ms Rhys:** That is the challenge. It is the same with changing the perception of Wales in the BBC in London. It really is. You are hitting your head against a wall often, but you just have to keep hitting it. The Eisteddfod, for instance, has a fantastic science pavilion. It really does have a science pavilion that it is well worth people visiting. I do not think that many people know that that science pavilion is there at the Eisteddfod. There are so many things. Maybe people think that singing and reciting poetry are about the cultural elite, and, let us face it, the talent on that stage is phenomenal, but I do not know how to answer your question, really, other than by taking people on trips to the Eisteddfod. I think that, once they go and once they see what is there, they do not feel that way any more. You have just got to throw yourself into the sea and learn to swim with it really.

[128] **William Graham:** Please be very quick now. Jeff is next and then Rhun.

[129] **Jeff Cuthbert:** I will try to be quick, Chair. Unfortunately, I am not a Welsh speaker. I am a perpetual learner, which is a painful experience for my tutor—I know that. However, in terms of the economic development of Wales, I think that it is a bit of a no-brainer that, in terms of tourism, hospitality and perhaps food manufacturing, as you have said—and, certainly, there is Welsh whisky, absolutely—there is value in terms of those occupational areas having an emphasis on the Welsh language. However, that is almost like a novelty approach. Now, I am not knocking that if it generates income for Wales and jobs. That is great. However, in terms of looking more generally at the economy—engineering, manufacturing and construction—to what extent do you think there would be clear economic benefits in enabling young people to pursue apprenticeships, through ConstructionSkills or

the engineering sector skills council, through the medium of Welsh? I know that there are barriers all right, as I have met them directly when I have spoken to young people about them, but—

[130] **William Graham:** Jeff, we need an answer, because—[*Inaudible.*]

[131] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Okay. So, I suppose that it goes back to your engagement with industry and the economy more generally. Do you see that as a problem? Should we concentrate on those niche areas, like tourism, or should we really invest efforts in making the Welsh language in industry more available?

[132] **Ms Rhys:** I suppose that you want a short answer now, as well, do you not? [*Laughter.*]

[133] **William Graham:** Yes, please.

[134] **Ms Rhys:** The answer is ‘yes’ and ‘yes’. I think that we have to concentrate on the areas where we know that we can succeed, but I think that it would be valuable for young scientists and engineers to understand that they can have a career in any of those fields and be able to converse in Welsh at the same time. Whether there is any direct financial implication for the economy in that, I do not know. What do you think?

[135] **Dr Rhisiart:** Well, I come from a business school, so my answer would be that the primary things for economic development would be education and skills, infrastructure and so on. That is the first point. What I would also say is maybe do not limit or predetermine where the value might be, because although, tangibly, it might be easier to point to tourism or food and drink, equally, I know of lawyers, accountants and investment analysts who provide advice in Welsh to other Welsh speakers, for whom that skill is very important.

[136] **Ms Rhys:** The caring industry is another one.

[137] **Dr Rhisiart:** Yes. So, although there might be, to some extent, a strategic focus on the visible brands and the visible artefacts of culture, because they also help with exporting Wales to the world, I would not want it to be limited to those, because there are all sorts of other opportunities available.

[138] **Rhun ap Iorwerth:** Rwy'n falch iawn bod Jeff wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw, oherwydd roeddwn i'n meddwl bod y drafodaeth yn mynd braidd i gyfeiriad agweddau tuag at yr iaith Gymraeg, sy'n fater y tu hwnt i ni, fel pwyllgor. Hoffwn innau ofyn cwestiwn penodol ynglŷn â'r economi. Pwy ddylai rŵan fod yn gyfrifol am y gwaith o ymgysylltu efo busnesau i weithredu mewn ffyrdd sydd o fudd iddyn nhw a'r Gymraeg? Pwy ddylai fynd â hyn ymlaen rŵan? Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod, er enghraifft, sefydlu panel cyngori ar yr economi a'r Gymraeg, felly pwy ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am fynd â hyn ymlaen rŵan?

Rhun ap Iorwerth: I am very glad that Jeff asked that question, because I was beginning to think that the discussion was perhaps moving towards attitudes towards the Welsh language, which is a matter that is beyond us as a committee. I want to ask a specific question about the economy. Who should now be responsible for the work of engaging with businesses to act in a way that benefits them and the Welsh language? Who should take that forward now? The Government has rejected, for example, the setting up of an advisory panel on the economy and the Welsh language, so who should be responsible for taking this forward now?

[139] **Ms Rhys:** Yn gyntaf i gyd, rwy'n falch eich bod wedi gwneud y sylw ynglŷn â

Ms Rhys: First of all, I am pleased that you made that comment about how this

sut oedd y sgwrs hon yn mynd, achos dyna oedd un o broblemau ein panel—‘a oeddem i fod i edrych ar yr ochr ieithyddol ac at agweddau at y Gymraeg yn ogystal â’r economi?’—ac felly roedd hynny, i raddau, yn hollti ein dadleuon a’n dyletswyddau. Felly, rwy’n cydymdeimlo â hynny.

conversation was going, because that was one of the problems for our panel—‘were we were supposed to look at the linguistic issues and at attitudes towards the Welsh language, as well as the economy?’—and so that, to some extent, split our discussions and our duties. So, I sympathise with that.

[140] Pwy ddylai fynd â hyn ymlaen? Wel, rwy’n credu bod angen i’r Llywodraeth edrych ar yr hyn y gallai ei wneud. Rydym wedi gwneud ein hargymhellion ni, yn y gobaith y byddant yn cael eu derbyn, ac, yn sicr, mae eisiau edrych tamaid bach yn fwy ar yr ochr honno o bethau, gyda rhywun gwell na fi yn cadeirio ac yn symud hyn ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn gwybod pwy allai gymryd hyn ymlaen. Efallai dy fod di, Martin, yn gwybod. Fodd bynnag, rwy’n credu mai cyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth ydyw. Os ydym eisiau i’r economi ffynnu, rhaid i’r arweiniad ddod oddi wrthydd chi.

Who should take this forward? Well, I do think that there is a need for the Government to look at what it could do. We have made our recommendations, in the hope that they will be taken forward, and, certainly, there is a need to look a little bit more at that side of things, with someone more qualified than me to chair and to move this forward. However, I am not sure who could take this forward. Perhaps you, Martin, might know. However, I think that it is the Government’s responsibility. If we want the economy to prosper, then the leadership has to come from you.

[141] **Dr Rhisiart:** Lle mae methiant marchnad, fel petai, y Llywodraeth ddylai ymyrryd. ‘Nawr, mae rôl bwysig iawn gan y Llywodraeth, a byddai pawb yn cydnabod hynny, o ran materion datblygu economaidd, gan gynnwys trafnidiaeth, is-strwythur ac yn y blaen. O ran hynny, nid yw’n mynd yn bell o brif orchwyl y Llywodraeth ac o’r hyn y mae pobl yn meddwl y dylai’r Llywodraeth ymyrryd yn ei gylch. Felly, rwy’n meddwl ein bod ni yn gytûn yn y grŵp na fyddem am i’r Gymraeg gael ei *ghetto*-eiddio, a’i rhoi mewn cymuned o bobl sydd eisiau hybu’r Gymraeg, ond iddi fod yn rhan annatod o ddatblygu economaidd. Felly, mae’r hyn yr ydym wedi’i ddweud o ran caffael, er enghraifft, yn mynd yn syth at ymarferoldeb gweithredu’r ffordd y mae’r sector cyhoeddus yn pwr casu ac yn prynu nwyddau. Felly, mae pethau ymarferol y mae’r Llywodraeth yn gallu eu gwneud.

Dr Rhisiart: Where there is market failure, as it were, it is the Government that should intervene. Now, there is an important role for Government, and everybody would recognise that, in terms of economic development issues, including transport, infrastructure and so on. In that sense, it does not stray far beyond the Government’s remit, or beyond what people think the Government should intervene in. So, I think that we were in agreement in the group that we did not want to see the ghettoisation of the language, or for it to be placed in a community that wants the Welsh language to prosper; rather, it should be an integral part of economic development. So, what we have said on procurement, for example, goes straight to the practicality of how the public sector procures and buys products. So, there are practical things that the Government can do.

[142] **Rhun ap Iorwerth:** Yn amlwg, y Llywodraeth sy’n gorfod rhoi’r arweiniad, ond pwy ddylai weithredu? Mae cyfeiriad wedi bod at fentrau iaith a’u rôl nhw. Beth am Busnes Cymru? Ai hwnnw ddylai fod yr asiant sy’n ymgysylltu efo busnesau? Sut mae gwneud hyn yn ymarferol, gan dderbyn, wrth gwrs, mai’r Llywodraeth sy’n gorfod rhoi’r arweiniad?

Rhun ap Iorwerth: Clearly, it is the Government that has to take the lead, but who should be doing the implementing? Reference has been made to the *mentrau iaith* and their role. What about Business Wales? Should that be the agency that engages with businesses? How can this be done on a practical level, while accepting, of course, that the Government has to take the lead?

[143] **Dr Rhisiart:** O ran Busnes Cymru, dros y blynyddoedd, rydym wedi gweld sawl fersiwn o raglenni darparu cyngor busnes yng Nghymru drwy'r Llywodraeth ac, ar ei ffurf bresennol, Busnes Cymru sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Felly, drwy bartneriaid ac is-gontractwyr, dyna sut y rhoddir cyngor bob dydd i fusnesau bach a mawr ar bob mathau o faterion, o ddechrau busnes i dyfu busnes ac yn y blaen, ac, wrth gwrs, asesu anghenion sgiliau busnesau hefyd. Felly, mae prif ffrydio'r Gymraeg fel rhan annatod o'r rhaglen honno'n bwysig.

Dr Rhisiart: In terms of Business Wales, over the years, we have seen business advice programmes in Wales provided in various guises through Government and, in its current form, it is Business Wales that provides that service. So, through partners and sub-contractors, that is how everyday advice is given to small and big businesses on all sorts of issues, from setting up to growing and so on, and, of course, to assess the skills needs of businesses, too. Therefore, mainstreaming the Welsh language as an integral part of that programme is important.

[144] **Ms Rhys:** Mae gennych fudiadau ofnadwy o dda yng Nghymru, fel Menter a Busnes a'r mentrau iaith. Dim ond angen rhoi'r pŵer iddynt weithredu hwnnw sydd, mae'n siŵr.

Ms Rhys: You have some excellent organisations in Wales, like Menter a Busnes and the *mentrau iaith*. You need only empower them to take that forward.

[145] **Dr Rhisiart:** Rwy'n meddwl, gyda'r mentrau iaith, er y gallant fod yn wahanol o ran eu dalgylchoedd, byddai'n dda pe baent yn chwarae rhan flaenllaw iawn o ran datblygu economaidd, a phe na baem yn cael y gwahaniaethu artifisial hwn rhwng cenhadaeth gymdeithasol yn erbyn pwysigrwydd datblygu economaidd o fewn y gymdeithas.

Dr Rhisiart: I do think that, with the *mentrau iaith*, although they may be different in terms of their catchment areas, it would be positive if they were to play a proactive part in economic development, and if we did not have this artificial distinction between their social mission as against the importance of economic development within society.

[146] **William Graham:** Joyce, did you have further questions?

[147] **Joyce Watson:** No, I have finished.

[148] **William Graham:** Gwenda, were you going to ask about public procurement?

[149] **Gwenda Thomas:** Yes, please.

[150] Mae gennyf dri chwestiwn. Mae'r cyntaf ar gaffael cyhoeddus, mae'r ail ar gymorth grantiau, ac mae'r trydydd ar ddata'r farchnad lafur. Felly, ar y cyntaf, beth yw eich ymateb chi i sylwadau'r Gweinidog bod mesurau eisoes yn eu lle i gonsidro'r iaith Gymraeg yn ystod y broses gaffael cyhoeddus, a bod angen i unrhyw les cymunedol a ddaw o gaffael cyhoeddus ddal ffocws ar recriwtio a hyfforddi?

I have three questions. The first is on public procurement, the second is on grants, and the third is on labour market data. So, on the first, what is your response to the Minister's comments that there are measures in place to consider the Welsh language during the public procurement process, and that there is a need for any community benefit that comes from public procurement to focus on recruitment and training?

[151] O ran fy ail gwestiwn, beth yw eich ymateb i awgrymiad y Gweinidog bod swyddogion yn ystyried yn barod gynllun iaith y Llywodraeth wrth ddosbarthu grantiau ac nad yw telerau iaith bob amser yn angenrheidiol?

On my second question, what is your response to the Minister's suggestion that officials already take account of the Government's Welsh language scheme when distributing grants and that language provisions are not always necessary?

[152] Yn drydydd, a allwch ddweud mwy wrthym am eich sylwadau bod angen i ni wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r data marchnad lafur ynglŷn ag anghenion sgiliau iaith Gymraeg cyflogwyr, gan gynnwys, os gwelwch yn dda, pwy ddylai arwain ar hyn a sut?

[153] **Ms Rhys:** Rwyf wedi anghofio beth oedd y cwestiynau 'nawr. [*Chwerthin.*]

[154] **Dr Rhisiart:** O ran caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus, mae wedi bod yn bwnc mawr dros y ddegawd ddiwethaf ac mae lot mwy o sylw wedi cael ei roi iddo fel arf o gadw gwerth ac o leoleiddio gwerth o fewn y gymuned ac o fewn Cymru. O ran y dystiolaeth y gwnaethom ni ei chasglu, roeddem yn meddwl bod potensial i gynnwys mwy o sylw at yr iaith Gymraeg o fewn yr agweddau hynny sy'n ymwneud â lles cymunedol. Nid wyf yn gwybod a oes newid sylweddol wedi bod ers hynny, oherwydd roeddem wedi gweithredu dros gyfnod o flwyddyn tan ddechrau eleni, felly mae ychydig bach o amser wedi mynd ers i rai o'r pethau hyn gael eu cyhoeddi.

[155] O ran eich ail bwynt, ar gynllun iaith y Llywodraeth a thelerau'r grantiau sy'n cael eu rhoi, yn bersonol, os ydych yn siarad â chwmni o'r Unol Daleithiau sydd am leoli yma ac rydych yn ystyried rhoi nawdd rhanbarthol iddo i'w ddenu yma, ac efallai fod rhyw 500 o swyddi yn y fantol, a gall fod mewn sector uwch-dechnolegol, rwy'n derbyn na fyddai defnydd o'r iaith Gymraeg ar frig y rhestr o bethau i'w trafod gyda'r cwmni hwnnw, os yw hynny'n ateb eich cwestiwn.

14.45

[156] Ar eich trydydd cwestiwn ar ddata'r farchnad lafur, y Llywodraeth fyddai'n gyfrifol, gyda'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol—ac rwy'n meddwl efallai fod mwy o bontio i'w wneud rhwng gwaith y swyddfa ystadegau a Chyfarwyddiaeth Ystadegol Llywodraeth Cymru, i sicrhau bod y data yn cael eu casglu a'u dadansoddi yn barhaol. Yn y maes hwn—ac mewn meysydd eraill hefyd—mae diffyg data Cymreig. Buais i'n rhan o'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ryw ddwy flynedd yn ôl ar ddinas-ranbarthau yng

Thirdly, could you tell us more about your comments that we need to make more use of the labour market data in respect of the Welsh language skills needs of employers, including, if you do not mind, who should lead on this and how?

Ms Rhys: I have forgotten what the questions were now. [*Laughter.*]

Dr Rhisiart: In terms of public sector procurement, that has been a major issue over the past decade and there has been a lot more attention given to it as a tool to maintain value and to localise value within the community and within Wales. In terms of the evidence that we gathered, we thought that there was potential to pay more attention to the Welsh language within those aspects relating to community benefits. I do not know whether there has been any significant change since then, because we had been operating for a period of more than a year up until the beginning of this year, so some time has elapsed since some of these things were announced.

On your second point, on the Government's Welsh language scheme and the conditions for awarding grants, if you are speaking to a company from the United States that wants to locate here, and you are considering awarding regional assistance to attract it here, and perhaps there are 500 jobs at stake, and it might be in a high-tech sector, I accept that the use of the Welsh language might not be top of the list of things to discuss with it, if that answers your question.

On your third question on labour market data, the Government would be responsible, along with the Office for National Statistics—and I think that there is perhaps more linking to be done between the work of the ONS and the Welsh Government's Statistical Directorate, to ensure that the data are collated and analysed continually. In this area—and in other areas too—there is a shortage of Welsh data. I was part of the task and finish group some two years ago on city regions in Wales, and a similar point arose then, that there was

Nghymru, ac roedd pwynt tebyg wedi codi bryd hynny, ynglŷn â diffyg data Cymreig. Felly, nid yw'n rhywbeth newydd i'r grŵp hwn, ond, yn y cyd-destun hwn, roeddem yn edrych ar siaradwyr Cymraeg a'r data am y farchnad lafur. Felly, rwy'n meddwl mai gorchwyl y Llywodraeth yw hyn, ond gan weithio gyda'r swyddfa ystadegau.

a shortage of Welsh data. So, this is not a new thing to this group, but, in this context, we were looking at Welsh speakers and the labour market data. So, I think that this would be part of the Government's remit, but in collaboration with the ONS.

[157] **Gwenda Thomas:** Diolch. Rwy'n gweld bod rhai o'ch argymhellion chi'n ymwneud â'r tri chwestiwn.

Gwenda Thomas: Thank you. I see that some of your recommendations relate to those three questions.

[158] **William Graham:** Are there any more questions from Members? I see that there are not. Thank you very much for your attendance today. It was a most interesting discussion. We are most grateful for your attendance, and thank you very much for coming.

[159] **Dr Rhisiart:** Diolch.

Dr Rhisiart: Thank you.

[160] **Ms Rhys:** Diolch yn fawr iawn.

Ms Rhys: Thank you very much.

14:46

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod

Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

[161] **William Graham:** I propose that

the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).

[162] I see that the committee is in agreement.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 14:46.
The public part of the meeting ended at 14:46.*